Silver nanoparticles exhibit antibacterial properties via bacterial inactivation and growth inhibition. The mechanism is not yet completely understood. This work was aimed at elucidating the effect of silver nanoparticles on inactivation of Escherichia coli, by studying particle–particle interactions in aqueous suspensions. Stable, molecularly capped, positively or negatively charged silver nanoparticles were mixed at 1 to 60 μg mL⁻¹ with suspended E. coli cells to examine their effect on inactivation of the bacteria. Gold nanoparticles with the same surfactant were used as a control, being of similar size but made up of a presumably inert metal. Log reduction of 5 log₁₀ and complete inactivation were obtained with the silver nanoparticles while the gold nanoparticles did not show any inactivation ability. The effect of molecularly capped nanoparticles on E. coli survival was dependent on particle number. Log reduction of E. coli was associated with the ratio between the number of nanoparticles and the initial bacterial cell count. Electrostatic attraction or repulsion mechanisms in silver nanoparticle–E. coli cell interactions did not contribute to the inactivation process.

1. Introduction

Silver in its ionic form (Ag⁺) is an environmentally friendly antimicrobial that is commonly used against many species of bacteria, including Escherichia coli [1–5]. Recent investigations of silver in the form of nanoparticles (Ag-NPs) have demonstrated a similar effect at lower concentrations than with the ionic form: effective concentrations of Ag-NPs and Ag⁺ have been reported in the nanomolar and micromolar ranges, respectively [6,7]. NPs generally exhibit inherent unique characteristics, such as large specific surface area, modified structure, controlled surface composition and reactivity, which endow them with remarkable physical, chemical and biological properties [6–9]. The development of new preparation methods that yield high concentrations and stable dispersions of Ag-NPs has led to a broader range of antibacterial applications [10–14].

Although Ag-NPs have been shown to effectively inactivate bacteria and inhibit microbial growth [8,11,15–21], the mechanism has yet to be fully elucidated. The bactericidal property of Ag-NPs is partially similar to that of silver ions [7]. Ag-NPs, like silver ions, attach to phosphate and sulfur groups that are part of the phospholipid cell membrane or to membranal proteins [8,22] and severely damage the cell and its major functions, such as permeability, regulation of enzymatic signaling activity, and cellular oxidation and respiratory processes [7,16,18,23]. Ag-NPs can penetrate the bacterial cell and accumulate to toxic levels that may cause death of the organism [22]. In addition, Ag-NPs can bind to the DNA inside the bacterial cells, preventing its replication [1,8], or interact with the bacterial ribosome [24]. Both Ag⁺ and free radicals derived from the Ag-NPs have been suggested to be responsible for the antimicrobial activity [8,12,17].

Recent studies have focused on some of the physicochemical properties of Ag-NPs, to identify exactly which of these particles’ physical or chemical properties is responsible for the effect on microorganisms. Ag-NPs’ inactivation of E. coli has been found to be associated with NP concentration [7,18], bacterial type [17,18], NP shape [17], the presence of Ag(I) [18] and NP size [8,10,15,18]. Moreover, bacterial growth in the presence of a given concentration of silver has been found to be dependent on the initial number of cells [7,18]. In the present study, an integrated approach was used to elucidate the combined impact of Ag-NP particle size, dose and initial number of bacterial cells on inactivation of planktonic cells suspended in water. To date, most of the applications involving Ag-NP bactericidal activity have dealt with interaction of bacteria with silver Ag-NP immobilized on agar plates [7,8,17]. However, this study examined a pretreatment technique based on the application of Ag-NPs in suspension. Such a pretreatment can be effective in controlling the formation of biofouling in water systems, such as distribution pipelines or membrane-filtration processes. The bactericidal activity of the NPs is hypothesized to be associated with the ratio between the number of NPs and the

A. Dror-Ehre, H. Mamane, T. Belenkov, G. Markovich, A. Adin

Department of Soil and Water Sciences, Faculty of Agriculture, Food and Environment, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Rehovot 76100, Israel
School of Mechanical Engineering, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv 69978, Israel
School of Chemistry, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv 69978, Israel

Keywords:
Nanoparticles
Biocolloids
E. coli survival
Surface charge
Colloidal interaction

Available online 28 July 2009
Received 1 June 2009
Article history:
E-mail address: adin@vms.huji.ac.il (A. Dror-Ehre).

© 2009 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved.
number of bacterial cells. Thus, a higher ratio will increase the fre-
quency of particle-bacterium collisions and attachment and in-
crease bacterial inactivation.

Previous studies have suggested electrostatic repulsion or at-
traction as the mechanism underlying the bactericidal properties
of Ag-NPs [24,25]. The bacterial surface is negatively charged due
carboxylic and phosphonate groups in the outer membrane [24].
However, both Ag-NPs with negative zeta potential and charge
[8,17,18] and metal oxide NPs with positive zeta potential and
charge [24], as well as positively charged silver ions [26], have
shown bactericidal activity. Although electrostatic forces between
particles are expected, electrostatic attraction as a significant
mechanism for NP attachment to bacteria has never been studied.

In the present study, negatively or positively charged mole-
cularly capped Ag-NPs (Ag-MCNPs) were prepared to elucidate the
influence of capping agent charge on the NPs’ ability to inactivate
planktonic E. coli suspended in water, to inhibit bacterial growth
and to further support the hypothesized numerical particulate ra-
tio approach. The experiments were carried out in aqueous suspen-
sions containing varying amounts of NPs and E. coli cells.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Materials

E. coli ATCC 35218 was purchased from Hy-Labs (Rehovot,
Israel). The Luria–Bertani (LB) medium used to grow and main-
tain the bacterial culture was supplied by Difico Laboratories,
and consisted of (in 1 L): 10 g tryptone, 5 g yeast extract and 5 g NaCl.
3-Mercaptopropionic acid (MPA; 99%) was obtained from Aldrich.
Silver nitrate was obtained from Carlo Erba reagents. Sodium
borohydride (NaBH₄; 99%) and polylysine (PL) 26,300 MW were
obtained from Sigma–Aldrich, as was hydrogen tetrachloroau-
rate(III) trihydrate.

2.2. Preparation of Ag-MCNPs and Au-MCNPs

NP synthesis is based on reducing metal ions in solution in the
presence of several types of stabilizing agents. As the source of sil-
ver ions, 50 mL of 0.04 M aqueous silver nitrate (AgNO₃) was
mixed with 0.33 mL of 0.3 M MPA as an anionic stabilizing agent
or 16.7 mL of 4.8 mM PL as a cationic stabilizing agent. The solu-
tion was stirred and the pH adjusted to 7 using NaOH. Fifty milli-
liter of 0.004 M NaBH₄ was added slowly to the solution in order to
reduce the Ag ions. A dark brown color appeared while adding the
NaBH₄ until the solution appearance stabilized. Finally, stable
MCNPs with negative or positive charge were obtained. A disper-
sion of particles with a relatively narrow size distribution was ob-
tained after removing the larger particles and aggregates by
centrifugation at 20,000 rcf for 10 min for Ag-PL particles and cen-
trifugation at 20,000 rcf for 30 min for Ag-MPA particles. Gold NPs
(Au-MCNPs) were synthesized following the same protocol with
50 mL of 0.004 M aqueous gold chloride trihydrate used as the
source of the gold ions.

2.3. Methodology for studying the effect of MCNPs on E. coli inactivation

E. coli ATCC 35218 was grown in 80 mL liquid LB medium to
mid-log phase (OD₅₇₀ of about 0.4). E. coli in the range of 10⁸–
10⁹ colony forming units (CFU) was suspended in 1 mL distilled
water supplemented with negatively or positively surface-charged
MCNPs. The particle concentration in the suspensions varied from
1 to 60 μg mL⁻¹. Those μg/mL concentrations were directly calcu-
lated from the final molar concentration of the silver inserted in
the preparation. A similar suspension without NPs was used as a
control. A suspension of Au-MCNPs with the same surfactants
and average size was used as another similarly sized but presum-
ably inert metal control for the NPs. Pure surfactant solutions (PL,
MPA) were used as vehicle controls. The suspensions of bacteria
and NPs were thoroughly vortexed for 1 min and 50-μL aliquots
were cultured on LB agar plates. The plates were incubated at
37 °C for 24 h. Colonies were counted and log reduction (log₁₀N₀/N)
for each treatment was calculated relative to the colony count
of untreated bacteria (N₀), with N representing the number of bac-
teria (CFU) that survived the treatment. All experiments were per-
formed in triplicate under sterile conditions.

The interaction between E. coli and NPs was examined by trans-
mission electron microscopy (TEM). For specimen preparation,
samples containing distilled water, 10⁷ CFU mL⁻¹ E. coli and
45 μg mL⁻¹ Ag-MCNPs or Au-MCNPs were prepared. A 10-μL drop
was deposited on a TEM copper grid with a lacy carbon film. To fix
the bacteria, the grids were exposed to 2.5% (v/v) glutaraldehyde in
PBS solution for 30 min. Grids were washed three times in PBS
and three times in distilled water, to remove salt and buffer deposits.
The bacteria-NP specimens were imaged in a FEI Tecnai F20 TEM.

2.4. Methodology for studying the effect of Ag-MCNPs on bacterial growth rate

A fresh colony of mid-log phase E. coli (10⁸ CFU mL⁻¹) grown in
LB medium was thoroughly mixed with 50 μg mL⁻¹ Ag-PL (sample
PL50) and 33 μg mL⁻¹ Ag-PL (sample PL33) in water. Aliquots
(2 mL) of each suspension (treated or untreated bacteria) were
inoculated into 100 mL fresh LB medium (without NPs). The sus-
pensions were agitated in a shaker bath. Growth trends were mon-
tored by OD₅₇₀ measurements performed at predetermined
intervals. The spectrophotometry reference was the same LB med-
ium without bacteria.

2.5. Characterization

The OD of the bacterial cultures in liquid LB medium was eval-
uated using a UV2000RS spectrophotometer. Particle size distribu-
tion, average particle size, morphology and colloidal stability of
the Ag-MCNPs were characterized by TEM. The size characteriza-
tion of the samples was carried out on TEM images using the Dig-
ital Micrograph software by Gatan. The data were statistically
analyzed using OriginPro 6.1 software. Zeta potential measure-
ments were made in an electrophoretic light-scattering apparatus
(Zeta Sizer-Nano series Malvern Instruments) to examine NP
colloidal stability and charge.

3. Results and discussion

Under the conditions used to prepare the Ag-MCNPs, the parti-
cles had a roughly spherical shape with a relatively narrow size
distribution, formed stable dispersions, and were positively or neg-
atively charged. Zeta potential values were 40.2 mV and –46.1 mV
for the positive Ag-PL and negative Ag-MPA particles, respectively.
These values are characteristic of stable colloids [27]. The anionic
capping agent, MPA, is a small, widely available, inexpensive anio-
nic surfactant from the family of thiol-containing molecules. Thiol
groups form strong bonds to gold and silver surfaces making them
the optimal anchor group and the carboxyl group provides the neg-
ative charge at neutral pH. Analogous amine-containing thiols that
should be able to provide the positively charged counterpart at
neutral pH are not able to stabilize the Ag-NP colloidal dispersion.
A possible reason for this asymmetry is the high affinity of the
amine group to the silver and gold surfaces. The bifunctional
thiol-amine molecules act as efficient crosslinkers between the NPs, inducing their aggregation and precipitation. Thus, for cationic Ag-NPs, low-molecular-weight PL was found to be an excellent surfactant, generating stable dispersions of isolated single or a few particles with a high zeta potential value, indicating high positive charge density at the PL-coated particle surfaces with minimal interparticle crosslinking, probably due to the strong electrostatic and steric repulsions.

Table 1 displays the details of the various NP samples (A–D), indicating surfactant type and charge, centrifugation conditions and the resulting mean size. Two substantially different mean sizes for each of the MPA- and PL-coated MCNPs were obtained. Fig. 1 shows size-distribution histograms of particle types A and B which were evaluated by analyzing the TEM micrographs. Fig. 2 presents a representative TEM micrograph of type A NPs which appear well-dispersed upon stabilization with PL.

The effect of MCNPs on the viability of planktonic E. coli cells suspended in water was assumed to be associated with the interaction between the Ag-NPs and the suspended microorganism (also termed biocolloid). The experimental setup therefore included varying amounts of the two types of particles (i.e. NPs and biocolloids). The MCNPs were stable when diluted in water with the E. coli as no precipitation was observed.

The role of MCNP charge in determining the interactions between NPs and bacteria is not yet completely understood. Some studies have postulated that the electrostatic attraction between negatively charged membrane components and the positively charged NP surface is crucial for the interaction between bacteria and NPs [8,17]. In contrast, Stoimenov et al. [23] and Hamouda and Baker [28] assumed that particles with the same charge as the bacteria induce electrostatic repulsion and prevent the interaction between the particles. Fig. 3 presents the impact of MCNP surface charge and concentration on log inactivation of planktonic E. coli in water. An increase in the concentration of NPs with either positive or negative charge resulted in a similar increase in log inactivation. An increase in the bactericidal activity of Ag-NPs in the solid state has also been shown with increasing NP concentration [8,11,15–18]. One of the main focuses of such studies has been the development of antibacterial surfaces with biocidal activity for a variety of applications. However, the aqueous suspension of NPs in the present study can be used as a disinfectant in water systems prior to membrane-filtration processes. Complete inhibition of E. coli was observed at much lower silver concentrations than those needed to obtain a similar effect with surface-supported particles [11]. Thus, mixing the MCNPs with the biocolloids afforded enhanced inactivation, probably due to the higher probability of collision between the NPs and biocolloids in suspension. Moreover, Ag-PL and Ag-MPA at 8 μg mL⁻¹ showed an approximately 5 log₁₀ reduction with similar standard deviations. These results imply that under the experimental conditions, the influence of
electrostatic attraction or repulsion between the MCNPs and the negatively charged components in the E. coli membrane is probably insignificant for bacterial inactivation.

The effect of Ag-NP size on bacterial activity has been demonstrated previously, indicating that small particles are more active than larger particles per identical unit of silver mass [6,8,10,16]. The mean diameter of each NP type (PL or MPA Ag-NPs as presented in Table 1), its concentration and silver density were used to estimate the number density of the particles. The ratio between the number of NPs and the number of biocolloids (NP/NC) was calculated for each sample. Fig. 4 illustrates the inactivation ability of MCNP types A–D in relation to the NP-to-biocolloid ratio. Type B MCNPs at 6 μg mL⁻¹ and type D MCNPs at 45 μg mL⁻¹ showed similar NP/NC ratios and similar log₁₀ reductions. The activity of Au-MCNPs is also presented in Fig. 4 and, as expected, the treatment with gold NPs did not result in inactivation beyond an estimated threshold of 0.5 a log. Pure surfactant solutions, which were used as vehicle controls, showed nearly 100% survival of E. coli. These results are consistent with findings by Li et al. [21] who reported an improved antimicrobial effect with increasing NP concentration. While other researchers have observed a dependence on particle size, the present work clearly demonstrates that within a size range of approximately 5–15 nm, the important parameter is the NP/NC ratio rather than NP size itself. Fig. 4 supports this assumption by showing general trend of inactivation increase with increase in NP/NC ratio.

The effect of the initial number of bacterial cells on the extent of inactivation by Ag-NPs has been previously reported [7,18]. To elucidate this phenomenon within the framework of a particle-cell interaction approach, for a fixed MCNP concentration, the concentration of the bacteria was varied. Fig. 5 presents the logarithmic number of cells surviving treatment versus the NP-to-biocolloid ratio. The experiment was conducted with mid-log phase bacteria diluted by a factor of 10 to obtain 10⁵–10⁶ CFU mL⁻¹ of biocolloids, which were mixed with type A MCNPs at a concentration of 2, 7 or 12 μg mL⁻¹. The logarithmic number of cells surviving the treatment is expressed as log(N + 1) following the approach used by Pal et al. [7], which allows a logarithmic presentation of samples in which no colonies are detected in a treated volume (50 μL and complete inactivation N = 0). Initially, for low NP-to-biocolloid ratios, a constant high level of survival was observed up to about 1000 NPs per bacterium. Above this a first-order linear relationship was observed between the log of surviving bacterial cells and the NP-to-biocolloid ratio. Complete inactivation was observed at a ratio of approx. 2 × 10⁵. Regression analysis was performed on all the data fields used to fit the linear sections of the log inactivation curve with regression coefficient (R²) of 0.98. The linear curve was described by the following equation:

\[ \log(N + 1) = A - BNP/NC \]  

where A and B are empirical coefficients. Under these conditions, A and B were found to be 13.2 and 1.6, respectively. This equation can be used to evaluate the inactivation potential of NPs at given concentrations of Ag-NPs and bacteria.

In Fig. 4, the concentration of bacteria was fixed while the concentrations of MCNPs varied, while in Fig. 5 for each MCNP (Ag-PL) concentration (2, 7, 12 μg mL⁻¹), the concentration of bacteria was varied. Thus, in both cases, the log inactivation of planktonic E. coli depends on the NP/NC ratio.

It is suggested that the inactivation effect of MCNPs on bacteria is associated with collision and attachment efficiencies (so-called successful collision) between two particles of different sizes-NPs which are in the nanometer size range and biocolloids (bacteria cells) which are in the micrometer size range. While the collision frequency relies mainly on particle-transport mechanisms, such as hydraulic shear or diffusion, it can be expected that the attachment probability will be a function of the physicochemical properties of the MCNPs, such as charge, size or interface structure. Here we found that the impact of MCNPs on the tested bacteria is independent of charge. Further study is needed to examine interface structure as a crucial factor. The suspensions in this work were sheared by mixing, implying that the dominant transport factor was a velocity gradient rather than Brownian motion. In this case, the frequency of collisions, according to the classical Smoluchowski approach [29], is a function of the sum of the two particles’ diameters to the third power, the velocity gradient and the particles’ concentration (number of NPs and biocolloids) as presented in:

\[ J_0 = \frac{1}{6} N_j G(d_i + d_j)^3 \]  

Fig. 4. Bacterial inactivation versus NP/NC. The number and letter above each column represent concentration in μg mL⁻¹ and type of MCNP, respectively.

Fig. 5. Inactivation presented as log(N + 1) versus the NP/NC ratio.

Fig. 6. TEM micrograph of E. coli after treatment with Ag-MCNPs. Bar = 100 nm.
A bacterium. The results presented in Figs. 4 and 5 support this hypothesis that increasing number of NPs that can be attached to a bacterium results in a prolonged lag phase and a reduced final population. The mixing time, i.e. 10 min of shaking followed by a few seconds of vortexing, was kept constant in all samples.

This particulate approach assumes that the inactivation effect increases with increasing number of NPs that can be attached to a bacterium. The results presented in Figs. 4 and 5 support this assumption and also explain the previously reported dose and size dependencies.

Previous reports have found Ag-NPs attached to bacterial cell membranes as well as NPs inside the cells. Morones et al. [8] indicated that only NPs with a diameter of less than 10 nm exhibit a direct interaction with a few bacterial strains, including E. coli and Pseudomonas aeruginosa. Xu et al. [30], on the other hand, showed that Ag-NPs with sizes of up to 80 nm accumulate inside living P. aeruginosa cells, demonstrating that these Ag-NPs had been transported through the cells’ outer and inner membranes. Figs. 6 and 7 show TEM micrographs of Ag-MCNPs and Au-MCNPs attached to E. coli. Although visually, both micrographs appear similar, the particles’ inactivation properties are different: as opposed to Ag-MCNPs, Au-MCNPs did not show any inactivation ability. E. coli, a gram-negative bacterium, has a layer of peptidoglycan and a layer of lipopolysaccharide, both of which lack strength and rigidity [30]. This structure gives the NPs accessibility to anchoring sites on the cell wall [16]. It is assumed that the inactivation ability of MCNPs is associated with the number of successful NP attachments to anchoring sites.

Growth inhibition of bacteria grown in a liquid medium supplemented with Ag-NPs has been previously shown [7,16,18]. In the present study, the bacteria were treated with Ag-PL before addition into a LB medium without NPs. In Fig. 8, bacterial growth curves are shown for the non-treated control bacteria and bacteria pretreated with 33 and 50 μg mL⁻¹ Ag-PL. Aliquots of 2 mL were added into 200 mL LB medium for the control and PL33, and into 100 mL LB medium for PL50. A 5.6 log₁₀ reduction in bacterial count was found in the aliquot pre-treated with PL50. The first observation in Fig. 8 is that the kinetics of the growth process in all three curves follows typical bacterial population growth curves (a lag phase in which the bacteria are adapting to fresh medium, an exponential growth phase and a stationary phase with no net population increase or decrease). Under the experimental conditions, the lag phase of the treated bacteria was found to be more prolonged than that of the untreated bacteria, and the final population in the stationary phase was similar for the two treatment types but higher for the control. These results suggest that Ag-NPs can inhibit bacterial growth. Further studies are needed to explore the dependence of growth rate on the MCNP/N₀ ratio.

4. Conclusions

The inactivation effect of Ag-MCNPs on E. coli can be described by a colloid-particle interaction model. This effect was dependent on particle number, and log inactivation of E. coli showed a linear fit with the ratio between the number of NPs and the number of biocolloid particles measured as the initial bacterial cell count. This can be explained by an increase in NP-bacterium collision frequency. Au-MCNPs did not show any inactivation ability. Electrostatic attraction or repulsion between the Ag-MCNP and E. coli cell did not contribute to the inactivation process.

Acknowledgments

This research was partially supported by SWITCH (EU-funded research program). Prof. Jurkevitch and his lab members are acknowledged for assisting with the bacteriological work.

References